

CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza
 New York, NY 10006-1470
 T: +1 212 225 2000
 F: +1 212 225 3999
 clearygottlieb.com

WASHINGTON, D.C. • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW
 FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG
 BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL

D: +1 212-225-2086
 jrosenthal@cgsh.com

THOMAS J. MOLONEY	MARGARET S. PEONIS
RICHARD S. LINER	LISA M. SCHWEITZER
JAMES A. DUNCAN	JUAN G. GIRALDEZ
STEVEN M. LOEB	DUANE MCLAUGHLIN
CRAIG B. BROD	BREON S. PEACE
NICOLAS GRABAR	CHANTAL E. KORDULA
CHRISTOPHER E. AUSTIN	BENET J. O'REILLY
HOWARD S. ZELBO	ADAM E. FLEISHER
DAVID E. BRODSKY	SEAN A. O'NEAL
ARTHUR H. KOHN	GLENN P. MCGRORY
RICHARD J. COOPER	MATTHEW P. SALERNO
JEFFREY S. LEWIS	MICHAEL J. ALBANO
PAUL J. SHIM	VICTOR L. HOU
STEVEN L. WILNER	ROGER A. COOPER
ANDRES DE LA CRUZ	AMY R. SHAPIRO
DAVID C. LOPEZ	JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK
MICHAEL J. ROSENTHANG	ELIZABETH LEVAS
LEVI L. DASSIN	LUKE A. BARFOOT
NEIL O. WHORISKY	JOHN J. S. KOLODNER
JORGE U. JUANTORENA	DANIEL ILAN
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER	MEYER H. FEDIDA
DAVID LEINWAND	ADRIAN R. LEIPSIC
DIANA L. WOLLMAN	ELIZABETH VICENS
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL	ADAM J. BRENNEMAN
MICHAEL D. DAYAN	ARI D. MACKINNON
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.	JAMES E. LANGSTON
JEFFREY D. KARP	JARED GERBER
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW	COLIN D. LLOYD
ROBERT J. RAYMOND	COREY M. GOODMAN
SUNG K. KANG	RISHI ZUTSHI
SANDRA L. FLOW	JANE VANLARE
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO	DAVID H. HERRINGTON
FRANCESCA L. ODELL	KIMBERLY R. SPOERRI
WILLIAM L. MCRAE	AARON J. MEYERS
JASON FACTOR	DANIEL C. REYNOLDS
JOON H. KIM	ABENA A. MAINOO

HUGH C. CONROY, JR.	SANDRA M. ROCKS
JOSEPH LANZKRON	JUDITH KASSEL
MAURICE R. GINDI	PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOROU
KATHERINE R. REAVES	BOAZ S. MORAWI
RAHUL MUKHI	MARY E. ALCOCK
ELANA S. BRONSON	HEDIE H. GENFRITZ
MANUEL SILVA	KATHLEEN N. EMBERGER
KYLE A. HARRIS	AVRAM E. LUFT
LINA BENSMAI	ANDREW WEAVER
ARON M. ZUCKERMAN	HELENA K. GRANNIS
RESIDENT PARTNERS	JOHN V. HARRISON
	CAROLINE F. HAYDAY
	NEIL R. MARKEL
	KENNETH S. BLAZEJEWSKI
	LAURA BAGARELLA
	SHIRLEY M. LO
	JONATHAN D.W. GIFFORD
	SUSANNA E. PARKER
	DAVID W.S. YUDIN
	RESIDENT COUNSEL
	LOUISE M. PARENT
	OF COUNSEL

June 26, 2020

VIA ECF

The Honorable Alison J. Nathan
 United States District Judge
 United States District Court for the Southern District of New York
 Daniel Patrick Moynihan Courthouse
 500 Pearl Street
 New York, NY 10007

Re: *In re Application of Benjamin Steinmetz for an Order to Take Discovery from Vale S.A., Vale Americas Inc., Rio Tinto plc, and Rio Tinto Limited Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782, Case No. 20-mc-00212-AJN (S.D.N.Y.)*

Dear Judge Nathan:

We write on behalf of Vale S.A. and Vale Americas Inc. (collectively, “Vale”) in connection with the above-referenced application of Benjamin Steinmetz (“Steinmetz”) to conduct discovery for use in foreign proceedings pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 (the “Application”) to request permission to file a redacted version of Vale’s Memorandum of Law in Opposition to the Application of Benjamin Steinmetz for an Order to Take Discovery Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 (the “Vale MOL”) and to file under seal the Declaration of Samuel L. Levander in Support of the Vale MOL (the “Levander Declaration”). Vale respectfully seeks entry of an order substantially in the format attached hereto as Exhibit A (the “Proposed Order”). As described below, Steinmetz has consented to Vale’s filing these documents under seal.

I. Background

In the above-captioned action, petitioner Benjamin Steinmetz (“Steinmetz” or “Petitioner”) seeks an order pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 for discovery in aid of a foreign judicial proceeding (the “Application”). The Application is filed in connection with an action in

Hon. Alison J. Nathan, p. 2

the High Court of England and Wales (the “High Court”), captioned Vale S.A. v. Steinmetz, No. CL-2019-000723 (the “English Proceedings”), in which Vale S.A. is a plaintiff and Steinmetz is a defendant.

On December 3, 2019, the High Court granted a worldwide freezing order (the “WFO”) against Steinmetz, Dag Lars Cramer, Marcus Struik, Asher Avidan, Joseph Tchelet, David Clark, the Balda Foundation, and Nysco Management Corp. (together, the “Defendants”), finding that there was a real risk that the Defendants would dissipate their assets so that a judgment against them would go unsatisfied. Under the WFO, Steinmetz was obligated to disclose in writing all of his assets worldwide exceeding £25,000 in value, as well as information regarding the traceable proceeds of Vale’s \$500 million payment to BSG Resources Limited. See Declaration of Jeffrey A. Rosenthal in Support of Vale S.A. and Vale Americas Inc.’s Memorandum of Law in Opposition to the Application of Benjamin Steinmetz for an Order to Take Discovery Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 and Vale S.A.’s Conditional Cross-Application to Compel Reciprocal Discovery Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 (the “Rosenthal Declaration”), Ex. 8, Vale S.A. & Ors v. Steinmetz & Ors, No. CL-2019-000723, Freezing Order ¶ 11(1)-(3) (Dec. 3, 2019).

In his Application, Steinmetz claims that the discovery he seeks pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 is “urgent” because of the “substantial harm” caused by the WFO. See Memorandum of Law in Support of the Application of Benjamin Steinmetz for an Order to Take Discovery from Vale S.A., Vale Americas Inc., Rio Tinto plc, and Rio Tinto Limited Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782, ECF No. 3, at 24 (the “Steinmetz MOL”).

II. Legal Grounds for Sealing

As explained in the Vale MOL, Vale believes that Steinmetz has mischaracterized the status and procedural history of the English Proceedings, and the effect on him of the WFO. To correct Steinmetz’s mischaracterizations, Vale has sought, and the High Court has granted, permission to use Steinmetz’s Statement of Assets dated December 30, 2019, enclosed as the sole exhibit to the Levander Declaration, provided, however, that such filing is made under seal. See Vale S.A. v. Steinmetz, No. CL-2019-000723, Consent Order (June 22, 2020).¹ So as to comply with the High Court’s Order, Vale seeks leave to file publicly a redacted version of the Vale MOL (in which just one paragraph discussing the Statement of Assets is redacted) and to file the unredacted Vale MOL and the Levander Declaration under seal.

For the reasons stated above, Vale respectfully requests that the Court authorize it to file a redacted version of the Vale MOL and to file Exhibit A to the Levander Declaration under seal and any further relief deemed just, proper and equitable. Given than only Steinmetz and Vale are parties to the English Proceedings, Vale respectfully requests that the unredacted version of the Vale MOL and the Levander Declaration be made available only to Vale,

¹ Schedule B(9) of the WFO provides that the Claimants “undertake not to use without the permission of the Court any information obtained as a result of the [freezing order] for the purpose of any civil or criminal proceedings, either in England and Wales or in any other jurisdiction other than [for the purposes of the English Proceedings].” See Rosenthal Decl., Ex. 35, Vale S.A. v. Steinmetz, No. CL-2019-000723, Consent Order (June 22, 2020).

Hon. Alison J. Nathan, p. 3

Steinmetz, their respective counsel, and the Court. We are available at the Court's convenience to address any questions.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey A. Rosenthal
Jeffrey A. Rosenthal

cc: Josef M. Klazen, Esq.
Michael S. Kim, Esq.
Robin Rathmell, Esq.
Victoria R. Morris, Esq.
Carolina Leung, Esq.